Nations Unies A/HRC/17/35/Add.2



Distr. générale 15 avril 2011 Français Original: anglais

#### Conseil des droits de l'homme

Dix-septième session
Point 3 de l'ordre du jour
Promotion et protection de tous les droits de l'homme,
civils, politiques, économiques, sociaux et culturels,
y compris le droit au développement

Rapport de la Rapporteuse spéciale sur la traite des personnes, en particulier les femmes et les enfants, Joy Ngozi Ezeilo

Additif

Mission en Égypte\*

#### Résumé

La Rapporteuse spéciale sur la traite des personnes, en particulier les femmes et les enfants, Joy Ngozi Ezeilo, s'est rendue en Égypte du 11 au 21 avril 2010 à l'invitation du Gouvernement. Sa visite a principalement eu pour objet d'examiner toutes les formes de traite des personnes qui ont cours dans le pays et d'adresser des recommandations au Gouvernement afin qu'il renforce son action en vue de lutter contre ce phénomène en progression.

Dans le présent rapport, la Rapporteuse spéciale souligne les progrès encourageants accomplis par le Gouvernement, tels que l'adoption de la première loi sur la lutte contre la traite, les interventions ciblées visant à prévenir le mariage «temporaire» ou «saisonnier» de filles mineures ainsi que la mise sur pied de programmes de formation à l'intention des responsables de l'application des lois menés avec le concours technique d'organisations internationales. Néanmoins, le Gouvernement se heurte toujours à d'importantes difficultés s'agissant de lutter efficacement contre la traite des personnes et de protéger les droits fondamentaux des victimes de la traite. Ces difficultés concernent notamment, sans s'y limiter, le manque de données exhaustives sur l'évolution du phénomène de la traite des personnes, le caractère limité de la définition de la traite, l'absence de mécanismes d'identification et d'orientation des victimes, et le niveau insuffisant des infrastructures et des services visant spécifiquement à fournir une aide directe aux victimes. Sur la base de ces observations, la Rapporteuse spéciale adresse un certain nombre de recommandations au Gouvernement en vue d'un examen plus approfondi.

<sup>\*</sup> Le résumé du présent rapport est distribué dans toutes les langues officielles. Le rapport proprement dit est joint en annexe au résumé, et il est distribué dans la langue originale et en arabe seulement.



# **Annexe**

# Report by the Special Rapporteur on trafficking in persons, especially women and children, on her mission to Egypt (11 to 21 April 2010)

# Contents

			Paragraphs	Page
I.	Introduction and methodology		1–3	3
II.	Main findings		4–56	3
	A.	Forms and manifestations of trafficking in persons	4–11	3
	B.	Legislative, policy and institutional framework	12–24	6
	C.	Identification of trafficked persons	25–29	8
	D.	Protection of trafficked persons	30–38	10
	E.	Recovery and reintegration	39–41	12
	F.	Prosecution and punishment	42–44	13
	G.	Prevention	45–51	13
	H.	Partnership	52-56	15
III.	Positive post-mission developments		57-59	16
IV.	Conclusions and recommendations		60-81	17
	A.	Conclusions	60-61	17
	B.	Recommendations	62-81	17

# I. Introduction and methodology

- 1. At the invitation of the Government, Joy Ngozi Ezeilo, Special Rapporteur on trafficking in persons, especially women and children, carried out an official visit to Egypt from 11 to 21 April 2010. The objectives of the visit were to examine all forms of trafficking in persons prevalent in the country and to assess the impact of measures undertaken by the Government to combat trafficking in persons and to protect the human rights of trafficked persons.
- 2. During her mission, the Special Rapporteur visited Cairo, Al Hawamdia, Alexandria and Sharm el-Sheikh. The Special Rapporteur met the Minister of Manpower and Migration, the Minister of Family and Population, and high-level officials of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Ministry of Justice, Ministry of Interior, and Ministry of Social Solidarity. She also held meetings with members of the Public Prosecutor's Office and the People's Assembly, as well as a number of national institutions, including the National Coordinating Committee for Combating and Preventing Trafficking in Persons, the National Centre for Social and Criminological Research, the National Council for Human Rights, the National Council for Childhood and Motherhood, and the National Council for Women. The Special Rapporteur also met representatives of international organizations, non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and academic institutions working in the field of trafficking in persons. Finally, the Special Rapporteur visited shelters for women who are victims of violence, and children at risk of violence and abuse. In addition to the official agenda, on 18 April 2010, the Special Rapporteur delivered a lecture at Bibliotheca Alexandria on the global fight against trafficking in persons. She also participated in a highlevel meeting, "Enhancing the national efforts for combating and preventing trafficking in persons", organized by First Lady Suzanne Mubarak, on 20 April 2010.
- 3. The Special Rapporteur expresses her gratitude to the Government for its invitation and cooperation, and to the United Nations country team and other civil society organizations for their valuable inputs. It should be noted that this report was prepared on the basis of information received before and during the visit, as well as supplementary information submitted by the Government and civil society organizations after the visit.

# II. Main findings

# A. Forms and manifestations of trafficking in persons

4. The Special Rapporteur found that there was almost a complete absence of accurate data on trafficking in persons, which made it difficult to assess the trend and magnitude of this phenomenon. Owing to this gap, there is a lack of understanding of the trend, forms and manifestations of trafficking in persons in the country. The Special Rapporteur was concerned that various Government officials stated that Egypt is only a transit country for trafficking in persons, without being able to provide any supporting statistics or evidence-based analysis of the trend. In this regard, the Special Rapporteur welcomed the national study on trafficking in persons by the National Centre for Social and Criminological Research (NCSCR), which was ongoing at the time of her visit. The study represents a key step in bridging gaps in statistical information in order to enable all stakeholders to have a clear understanding of the main trends, forms and manifestations of trafficking in persons in Egypt. Thus, contrary to the common perception that Egypt is only a transit country, the study focused on the following areas as priorities: (a) marriage of women and girls as a form of trafficking in human beings; (b) exploitation of children for labour; (c) trafficking in street children; (d) sexual exploitation and prostitution; and (e) trafficking in human

organs. Similarly, based on interviews with a variety of stakeholders, the Special Rapporteur observed that Egypt is increasingly a source and destination country and the following forms of trafficking in persons appear to be of particular concern.

#### 1. "Seasonal" or "temporary" marriage

- The Special Rapporteur was informed that young women and girls, particularly those from poor families, are often married to men from the Gulf States for a short period of time. These so-called "seasonal" or "temporary" marriages are actively facilitated by marriage brokers and sometimes used as a smokescreen for providing sexual services to non-Egyptian men. It appears that this phenomenon is more widespread in certain parts of the country, such as the 6th of October Governorate. According to the survey on child marriage to non-Egyptians conducted by the National Council for Childhood and Motherhood (NCCM), 67 per cent of 2,000 families selected as samples in Al Hawamdia, Al Badrashein and Abu Al Nomros in the 6th of October Governorate responded that they are personally aware of child marriages to non-Egyptians in their areas of residence. The marriages were reportedly facilitated by marriage brokers in most cases. The survey also revealed that the driving factors for such marriages are mainly economic, including the higher amount of dowry paid by non-Egyptian spouses, poverty, low income of the families, and the girls' desire to escape strenuous work and difficult living conditions. Most of these "seasonal" or "temporary" marriages end when the husband returns to his home country, leaving the girl behind with no means to formally divorce her husband or no financial support, even when she bears children.
- 6. As an illustration, the Special Rapporteur learned first-hand of a case in which a 17-year-old girl from a poor family in Al Hawamdia married a man from the United Arab Emirates, who had promised to provide financial support for her family, as well as educational opportunities for her. Once she joined her husband in the United Arab Emirates, the promises fell by the wayside. She was forced to sexually serve her husband, and treated in a derogatory manner because she was an Egyptian.
- 7. In addition, the Special Rapporteur was informed of a 14-year-old Egyptian girl who was married in April 2010 in Abuja, Nigeria, to one Ahmed Yerima, a 50-year-old Senator and former governor of Zamfara State, Nigeria. According to reports received, the girl was brought to Nigeria along with 32 members of her family, as the marriage was prohibited in Egypt pursuant to Egyptian law which set the minimum age for marriage at 18 years old. According to information garnered, the Nigerian Senator allegedly paid \$100,000 to the family of the child to give her to him. It is not certain whether a broker was involved nor how much the broker may have collected. It was reported that the girl, who entered Nigeria on a tourist visa, returned to Egypt to continue her education following the consummation of her marriage. While the National Human Rights Commission and the National Agency for the Prohibition of Traffic in Persons and Other Related Matters in Nigeria requested the Attorney General and the Minister of Justice of Nigeria to prosecute Senator Yerima under the Child Rights Act 2003, the Attorney General has publicly stated that he will not prosecute Senator Yerima, because child marriage is not an offence under the sharia law applicable in the Zamfara State of Nigeria.

## 2. Trafficking for the purpose of slavery and forced labour

8. While trafficking for the purpose of slavery and forced labour has not received much attention in Egypt, the Special Rapporteur received information about over 30 non-Egyptian nationals who have been identified as victims of trafficking for slavery and forced labour. The majority of such foreign victims are Indonesians, who are given shelter at the Indonesian embassy in Cairo. As an illustration, the Special Rapporteur draws attention to the following cases:

- Case 1: A 20-year-old Indonesian woman was recruited in Indonesia to work as a domestic worker in Egypt. An Egyptian man, who acted as recruitment agent, married her so that she could obtain an entry visa for Egypt. Upon her arrival in Egypt in February 2010, she was sent to an Egyptian employer who abused her physically and psychologically. The employer did not pay her and prevented her from seeking medical care. She managed to run away and met an Egyptian man who promised to help her. However, he took her to a warehouse where he and a gang of men raped her several times, which left her with a broken hip. There was apparently no investigation of the said recruitment agent or employer. While the men who raped her were apparently detained by the police, it is not clear whether the police conducted a criminal investigation. The woman was returned to Indonesia according to her wish, and did not receive any compensation for the injuries she suffered.
- Case 2: A 17-year-old Indonesian woman travelled to Kuwait to work as a domestic worker. After six months, her Saudi employer took her to Egypt, where she was forced to work for five years without pay. She was subjected to severe physical abuse and forced to sleep in the bathroom. Despite the long working hours, she was not provided with adequate food, and her employer retained her travel documents at all times. She subsequently managed to escape from her employer and sought refuge at the Indonesian embassy. In the meantime, the employer filed a criminal complaint against her for stealing, and she was detained by the authorities. She was subsequently deported to Indonesia without any compensation for her work for five years.
- 9. These cases clearly show that migrant domestic workers are increasingly lured to Egypt for domestic work, and that there is a disturbing pattern of abuse and exploitation of trafficked domestic workers in Egypt. Given the prevalent use of domestic workers in households of all sectors of Egyptian society, it is also estimated that many children from low-income backgrounds are trafficked to work as domestic workers with promises of good salaries, and subjected to inhumane treatment.

#### 3. Trafficking for the purpose of removal of organs

10. The information received suggests that there is a high incidence of trafficking for this purpose. Trafficking for the removal of organs is reportedly committed on a fairly large scale, particularly targeting poor Egyptians and street children. The media also reported cases in which gangsters have approached street children and removed their kidneys in exchange for counterfeit money.

## 4. Trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation

11. The reports received suggest that women from Uzbekistan, Moldova, Ukraine, Russia and other states in Eastern Europe are often trafficked to Israel through Egypt. After the women arrive in Egypt as tourists, they are reportedly transferred to Sinai and escorted to the Israeli border through the Sinai desert by Bedouin who know the terrain well. The Special Rapporteur learned of reports about the disappearance of Russian-speaking tourists, as well as the experience of a Russian woman who was smuggled to Israel via the Sinai desert to ostensibly work as an au pair in Israel. There are risks that these women may have been trafficked to Israel for the purpose of commercial sexual exploitation.

# B. Legislative, policy and institutional framework

## 1. Legislative and policy framework

- 12. Egypt is party to a number of key international human rights instruments, including the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, the Convention on the Rights of the Child, and the Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families (ICRMW), the Forced Labour Convention, 1930 (No. 29), the Abolition of Forced Labour Convention, 1957 (No. 105), and the Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182). More importantly, Egypt ratified the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children (the Palermo Protocol) on 5 March 2004. At the regional level, Egypt ratified the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, and the African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child.
- 13. The Special Rapporteur welcomes the approval on 20 April 2010 of the new Law No. 64 of 2010 on combating trafficking in persons (the Trafficking Law), which reflects a high level of commitment on the part of the Government to implement its obligations under the Palermo Protocol. The Trafficking Law provides a definition of trafficking in persons similar to the one in the Palermo Protocol, and prohibits trafficking for the purpose of exploitation, which includes prostitution and other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour, slavery or practices similar to slavery, the sale of children, removal of organs and organized begging. It imposes a serious penalty on traffickers, consisting of imprisonment for not less than five years and a fine of not less than 50,000 EGP and not more than 200,000 EGP.
- 14. In addition, other legislation indirectly addresses the crime of trafficking. As these laws remain effective in conjunction with the Trafficking Law, the Special Rapporteur deems it pertinent to provide a brief overview of such legislation.
- Law No. 68 of 1951, as amended by Law No. 10 of 1961 on the Combating of Prostitution and Related Crimes in the Arab Republic of Egypt, criminalizes the act of inciting a person to engage in debauchery or prostitution, facilitating debauchery or prostitution, or employing or enticing a person to engage in debauchery or prostitution. The Law also makes it a crime to incite, employ, facilitate, or escort a person in or out of the country to work in debauchery or prostitution. Further, it is an offence under the Law to exploit the prostitution of another person, to open or run a place of debauchery or prostitution, and to lease or provide for a place for debauchery or prostitution. The problematic aspect of this law is that it also punishes anyone who engages in prostitution or debauchery, thereby criminalizing persons trafficked for the purpose of sexual exploitation. This problem may emanate from a misunderstanding of international treaties that Egypt has ratified, particularly the Palermo Protocol and the ILO's Forced Labour Convention No. 29. A crucial element of the definition of trafficking, as contained in article 3(a) of the Palermo Protocol, is its purpose, namely, exploitation, which is specifically defined to include forced labour or services, slavery or similar practices, servitude and various forms of sexual exploitation. The notion of labour exploitation inherent in this definition allows for a link to be established between the Palermo Protocol and the ILO's Forced Labour Convention No. 29. Furthermore, the Palermo Protocol contains a qualifying provision that the consent of a victim of trafficking to the intended exploitation shall be irrelevant where the means of coercion are used against an individual, including the threat or use of force, abduction, fraud, deception, the abuse of power or a position of vulnerability. It means therefore, for example, that a person's awareness of employment in the sex industry or in prostitution does not exclude such person from becoming a victim of trafficking. While being aware of the nature of the work, a person may be misled as to the conditions of work, which turn out

to be exploitative and coercive. Where the victim is a child, the crime of trafficking in persons can be established irrespective of the use of means of coercion or deceit referred to above.

- 16. Law No. 103 of 1976 was specifically designed to protect young Egyptian women wishing to marry non-Egyptian men, by requiring documentation of marriage contracts at the public notary office. This procedure obliges the non-Egyptian man wishing to marry an Egyptian woman to submit a certificate from his country's embassy stating that there are no impediments to the execution of the marriage, and also to make a deposit in a bank in the bride's name, as security for her. In practice, this law is largely ineffective as an indiscriminate number of arranged and exploitative seasonal/temporary marriages between Egyptian women and foreign men continue to take place.
- 17. In response to the growing phenomenon of trafficking in children, the Government introduced a number of important legislative amendments in 2008. Law No. 126 of 2008 amended Law No. 143 of 1994 on Civil Status, and raised the minimum age of marriage for girls to 18 years. The same Law introduced an important amendment to Law No. 58 of 1937 (the Penal Code), which criminalizes trafficking in children. According to article 291 of the Penal Code, forced labour for a period of not less than five years and a fine of not less than 50,000 EGP but not exceeding 200,000 EGP shall be imposed on anyone who "buys or sells a child, or offers a child for sale, or anyone who delivers or accepts or transfers a child as a slave, or exploits the child sexually or commercially, exploits the child in forced labour or other illegal purposes, even if the crime is committed transnationally".
- 18. It is also relevant to note that the Parliament adopted in March 2010 the Organ Harvesting and Transplant Act, which prohibits commercial trading in organs and regulates organ transplantation. The Act restricts organ transplants between Egyptians and foreigners to limited circumstances, and sets out conditions to be fulfilled in transplanting organs from living or non-living organ donors, such as clear and informed consent of the donors.
- 19. These laws, despite their importance, did not address all forms of trafficking in persons as provided in the Palermo Protocol, and consequently a lacuna remained in responding to other forms of trafficking, notably trafficking for the purpose of labour exploitation. While the Labour Code regulates conditions of work and imposes penalties on employers who breach such conditions, it does not protect domestic workers, who are often vulnerable to abuse and exploitation and may include trafficked persons. Consequently, the Special Rapporteur hopes that the Trafficking Law will effectively address this lacuna and serve as a fundamental basis on which all cases of trafficking may be effectively investigated and prosecuted.

## 2. Institutional framework

20. A number of ministries and national institutions play important roles in the fight against trafficking in persons. Most importantly, the National Coordinating Committee, originally established by the Prime Minister's decree of 15 July 2007 and given a legal status by the Trafficking Law, serves as a coordination mechanism for all anti-trafficking efforts at the national level. The National Coordinating Committee is headed by the Advisor to the Minister of Foreign Affairs and is comprised of representatives of ministries relevant in combating trafficking in persons, such as the Ministry of Interior, the Ministry of Justice, the Ministry of Manpower and Migration, the Ministry of Social Solidarity and the Ministry of Tourism. Its mandate includes, inter alia, drafting legislation and a national plan of action on combating trafficking in persons, suggesting measures, policies and programs to assist and protect the victims, and building the capacity of criminal justice officials in the application of the Palermo Protocol.

- 21. The Ministry of Family and Population (MFP), responsible for the protection of family and children, has been the driving force behind the legislative amendments and other important policy developments to prohibit and prevent trafficking in children. In December 2007, the MFP established an Anti-Trafficking Unit to address trafficking in children through 3Ps, namely, prevention, protection and prosecution. The Unit has so far accomplished a number of achievements, including the establishment of a national plan of action on preventing trafficking in children, the 16021 hotline for family counselling and reporting child marriages, and a daycare centre for children at risk of violence and abuse in El Salam city.
- 22. The National Council of Women (NCW), established in 2000 to support women's achievement and to strengthen their role in society, addresses to some extent trafficking in women within the context of violence against women. In April 2009, NCW published a comprehensive report on violence against women in Egypt, which identified "seasonal" or "temporary" marriage as a potential form of human trafficking and recommended that decision makers determine whether it should be considered as human trafficking. Further, NCW has a complaint office<sup>1</sup>, which receives complaints via hotline, fax, mail and face-to-face interviews.
- 23. The National Council for Human Rights (NCHR), the independent body responsible for monitoring the protection of human rights and raising awareness of human rights, plays a supporting role in the efforts to combat trafficking in persons. NCHR, in cooperation with NCSCR, held a series of seminars in 2009 on various topics in the context of trafficking in persons, such as organ trading, child marriage, irregular migration, forced labour, street children, women's rights and domestic servants. NCHR has various mechanisms through which citizens outside Cairo may access it, including a Complaints Office in Sohag Governorate, mobile complaint teams which travel to various governorates, and a free hotline number.
- 24. The Special Rapporteur observed that coordination of work of different ministries and national institutions remains a challenge. In addition to the above bodies which have specific mandates and tasks relevant to trafficking, there are other governmental authorities and institutions which may have overlapping responsibilities, such as the Ministry of Social Solidarity, whose mandate extends to providing for women in vulnerable circumstances, and the NCCM which is responsible for policymaking and co-ordination of activities in the areas of child protection. While commending the work of the National Coordinating Committee in coordinating and exercising leadership in both governmental and non-governmental efforts to combat trafficking, the level of resources allocated to the Committee does not seem commensurate with the level of its responsibility. The secretariat of the Committee is provided by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, rather than it being a separate office which is designed to exclusively work on the issues of trafficking on a permanent basis.

# C. Identification of trafficked persons

25. The Special Rapporteur found that accurate identification of trafficked persons is a significant challenge in Egypt and may be explained by a number of factors. First, as there was no legislation specifically addressing trafficking in persons before the enactment of the Trafficking Law, the governmental authorities seem to mix the phenomenon of trafficking in persons with other related phenomena, such as irregular migration, illegal adoption, and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> This office is referred to as "the Ombudsman's Office". See National Council for Women, Report 2000-2005.

violence against women and children. The Ministry of Interior, for instance, maintained that Egypt is only a transit country and that trafficking in persons only concerns African migrants attempting to cross the border to Israel irregularly. The Special Rapporteur was concerned that such a lack of understanding of the definition and trend of trafficking in persons may have resulted in misidentification of trafficked persons in some cases.

- 26. Second, identification of trafficked persons is not an institutionalized practice within the governmental authorities that may be the first contact with trafficked persons, such as the Ministry of Manpower and Migration, and the Ministry of Interior. There are no established procedures or guidelines for governmental authorities to rapidly identify trafficked persons and refer them to appropriate care and services. While the Ministry of Manpower and Migration has a labour inspection system in place to monitor conditions in workplaces, labour inspectors are not equipped with the capacity, knowledge and skills to detect trafficked persons in workplaces.
- 27. In this context, it is of particular concern that migrants, mostly from Eritrea, are often shot dead by border guards as they try to cross the Egypt-Israel border in an irregular manner. In 2009, the killing of 19 migrants was reported. The death toll in 2010 was already 12 at the time of the Special Rapporteur's visit. While the Ministry of Interior maintained that this is strictly a border security issue, the Special Rapporteur was concerned about the apparent lack of efforts on the part of the border guards to identify any potential victims of trafficking among the migrants. Again, this demonstrates the lack of understanding about trafficking in persons on the part of law enforcement officials, and the lack of capacity and institutionalized procedures to properly identify trafficked persons.
- The Special Rapporteur positively noted that the MFP has been actively conducting training for key governmental authorities and other stakeholders to raise awareness about trafficking in persons. The Special Rapporteur was informed that the MFP had organized a number of training workshops, targeting not only law enforcement officials and immigration officials, but also a wide range of stakeholders, including physicians, nurses, labour inspectors, tourism inspectors and religious leaders. Further, the Government has been fully cooperating with International Organization for Migration (IOM) in implementing a number of training programmes since 2008, targeting law enforcement officials. In June 2008, IOM organized a three-week course for law enforcement officials on combating trafficking and prosecuting traffickers, as well as a follow-up two-week course on protecting victims of trafficking and prosecuting traffickers in October 2009. While the Special Rapporteur commends these capacity-building efforts, there is a need to develop specific guidelines and procedures on identifying trafficked persons and ensure that they are institutionalized among governmental authorities which may be called on to identify, assist and support trafficked persons. In this regard, the Special Rapporteur welcomes the initiatives of IOM to develop guidelines for the police and prosecutors on identifying and treating trafficked persons in accordance with the Trafficking Law.
- 29. The additional obstacle to proper identification of trafficked persons is the lack of services such as hotlines for early identification and reporting of trafficking cases. While hotlines have been established by the MFP, NCW and NCHR, they are not specifically designed to receive information on trafficking cases. The 16012 family-counselling line of the MFP received a total of 20,000 calls, and only 0.72 per cent of the calls (144 calls) related to child marriages. While the Special Rapporteur acknowledges the importance and usefulness of the 16012 family-counselling line, these statistics indicate that it should not be exclusively relied upon as a tool to detect potential cases of trafficking. In a similar vein, the hotlines operated by NCW and NCHR are not known to have been used to report cases of trafficking in persons. Further, these hotlines are operated in Arabic only, and therefore do not have the capacity to reach out to potential victims of trafficking who do not speak Arabic. In order to ensure that cases of trafficking are quickly identified and referred to the

appropriate authorities, it is crucial to establish a separate hotline specifically designed to detect cases of trafficking, and staffed by multilingual personnel with adequate knowledge of trafficking in persons.

# D. Protection of trafficked persons

30. Once identified as such, trafficked persons should be provided with appropriate care and assistance so that they are protected from further exploitation and harm. Regrettably, the Special Rapporteur found that the level of infrastructure and services available to trafficked persons in Egypt is inadequate.

#### 1. Shelters

- 31. At the time of the Special Rapporteur's visit, there were no shelters specifically intended for trafficked persons. However, the Special Rapporteur visited shelters for women and girls who are victims of violence, maintained by NGOs under the supervision of the Ministry of Social Solidarity. There are reportedly nine shelters of this kind in Egypt. In Cairo and Alexandria, the Special Rapporteur visited two shelters which provide temporary refuge for battered women and assists their recovery and reintegration into their families. The shelter in Cairo has a maximum capacity of 22 persons, and four women and one child were staying at the shelter at the time of the Special Rapporteur's visit. In 2009, the shelter accommodated 75 women, and none of them was reported to be trafficked. The shelter is designed to be a temporary refuge for victims of violence and they may only stay at the shelter for a maximum period of one month, except where the Supervisory Committee of the shelter determines that a longer stay may be permitted. The shelter in Alexandria accommodated 15 cases in 2009, none of which concerned trafficked persons. Most of the cases concerned physical or sexual violence within the domestic context. The Special Rapporteur observed that neither of the shelters provides adequate protection to victims of violence, as their predominant focus is on reconciling families through mediation so that women and girls can return to their families, rather than providing them with protection from violence and necessary support to address its root causes. Further, both shelters impose eligibility criteria, which exclude trafficked persons who are most likely to be unmarried and non-resident. For instance, these shelters do not accept divorced women. Women must also produce a valid identity card and be physically and mentally fit. They must also reside in the governorate where the shelter is located and must not have any close relatives in the same governorate.
- 32. The Special Rapporteur also visited shelters for children at risk of violence and abuse. In Cairo, the Special Rapporteur visited a private charity which provides safe accommodation and a family environment to orphans. At the time of the visit, it accommodated 43 children, including eight girls. It is equipped with a private school, where children can learn a variety of subjects, such as literacy, information technology, religion, and carpentry. In Alexandria, the Special Rapporteur visited another shelter run by an NGO, which provides accommodation to street children. None of the children at these shelters was reportedly trafficked, although they were clearly in circumstances which create risks of being trafficked.
- 33. The Special Rapporteur was concerned that trafficked persons are falling through the protection gap in the absence of shelters specifically designed to accommodate and provide protection to trafficked persons. The existing shelters are clearly inadequate to accommodate trafficked persons, whose circumstances and needs are different from those of victims of violence, or children at risk of violence. It is also of serious concern that the existing shelters only accommodate Egyptians, thereby leaving foreign victims of trafficking without any place of refuge. The above-mentioned cases of Indonesian domestic

workers who were trafficked to Egypt<sup>2</sup> clearly point to the lack of adequate protection for foreign victims of trafficking; they had to find their way to the Indonesian embassy for refuge at the risk of being caught by their employers.

#### 2. Physical and psychological care and services

- 34. Specialized medical and health services for trafficked persons are still in the development stage in Egypt. The Special Rapporteur noted that some of the shelters mentioned above provide access to doctors and psychiatrists. In particular, women who arrive at the shelter in Alexandria are examined by doctors upon their arrival. Further, El Salam Center for the Rehabilitation and Integration of Child Victims of Exploitation (El Salam Center), a daycare centre for children at risk, which was established by NCCM in January 2009, provides children with medical services and psychological counselling in cooperation with El Herafeyyen and El Salam Medical Centers. However, since these facilities are not specifically designed to accommodate trafficked persons, it is not clear if they are equipped with the knowledge and skills to provide adequate support to trafficked persons.
- 35. In this regard, the Special Rapporteur was encouraged by the establishment of a pilot Trafficking Victim Support Unit within the National Bank Hospital by the Ministry of Health with the support of IOM. This unit is equipped with highly qualified medical professionals, specifically trained by IOM to provide appropriate care and treatment to trafficked persons. The unit currently has the capacity to accommodate four inpatients and the Ministry of Health plans to expand capacity in the future so that women and girls can be accommodated completely separately from men and boys. While the Special Rapporteur was impressed with the unit, she was concerned that it has not received any patients due to the absence of a formal referral mechanism to allow trafficked persons to access the unit. While the Ministry of Health reportedly insists that trafficked persons must be officially referred to the unit as victims of trafficking in order to be treated, such referral mechanism is not yet in place. To the Special Rapporteur's disappointment, this uncertainty has resulted in at least one unfortunate situation in which a trafficked person who was the victim of rape, and who required urgent medical attention, could not be treated at the unit.
- 36. At the time of the Special Rapporteur's visit, the Suzanne Mubarak Regional Centre for Women's Health and Development in Alexandria was preparing a Family Support Clinic designed to provide medical and psychological services to women who are victims of domestic violence. The Clinic has a great potential to extend its services to trafficked persons, provided that its personnel receive specialized training to provide appropriate services to trafficked persons.

#### 3. Redress and legal assistance

37. The Special Rapporteur was informed that there is a general lack of legal assistance available to victims of human rights violations, and access to justice is limited, particularly if the victims are considered not to conform with traditional values or to have contributed to the human rights violations themselves. The Ministry of Justice and national institutions provide legal aid services on a rather *ad hoc* basis. For instance, the complaint office of NCW is assisted by pro bono lawyers who provide legal aid services for some of the cases submitted to the complaints office. However, it is not clear what criteria are used to determine cases eligible for legal aid services or to what extent such services have been provided. The gap is left to be filled by NGOs with limited resources and limited geographical reach. Further, NGOs do not have specific experience to provide legal

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See cases in paragraph 8 above.

services to trafficked persons. Thus, while the Trafficking Law provides for the right to legal assistance for victims of trafficking, it is not clear whether a system and resources necessary to fulfil this obligation exist in practice at this stage.

38. It is positive to note that the University of Alexandria established, in January 2010, a legal clinic which provides legal aid services for victims of domestic violence and trafficked persons. The clinic is run by 26 students under the supervision of a law professor and cases are represented by lawyers on a pro bono basis. More than 100 lawyers reportedly agreed to provide services through the legal clinic, which is an encouraging sign. The innovative aspect of this clinic is that it is linked to the Family Support Clinic of the Suzanne Mubarak Regional Centre for Women's Health and Development, so that the Family Support Clinic directly refers cases which require legal assistance to the clinic, and vice versa.

## E. Recovery and reintegration

- 39. The Special Rapporteur praises the Trafficking Law which explicitly guarantees victims' right to social rehabilitation and reintegration into society. The Government's commitment to respect this right, particularly for children, is exemplified by the establishment of El Salam Center, whose mission is to facilitate recovery and reintegration of children at risk into their communities. To this end, it provides a variety of services, such as physical and psychological services, a literacy programme, vocational training, and awareness-raising about child exploitation. A total number of 1,456 children regularly visited El Salam Center in 2009, including 1,272 boys. They included street children, child victims of organized begging, children who are forced to work by their parents, children subjected to violence by their family members. The Special Rapporteur was encouraged by the Center's focus on capacity building and empowerment of children, as demonstrated by the fact that the children have their own committee which mediates any disputes among the children.
- 40. However, there is still a lack of infrastructure and services which facilitate recovery and reintegration of trafficked persons, as opposed to victims of violence or children at risk. Further, the Special Rapporteur was concerned that the existing facilities, including the shelters for women mentioned above, predominantly focus on reuniting families, rather than equipping victims of violence with skills and opportunities to enable them to make informed decisions about their reintegration. The existing facilities are not capable of adequately responding to the needs of trafficked persons in terms of recovery and reintegration, which are different from the needs of victims of domestic violence or children in vulnerable circumstances, such as street children.
- 41. In addition, it is of particular concern that in the case of foreign victims, the authorities seem to be exclusively concerned with repatriating them to their countries of origin, rather than providing them with necessary assistance for recovery. For instance, the Special Rapporteur learned of a case concerning a Ukrainian woman who was forced to work at a hotel in Hurghada for long hours under poor working conditions and subjected to inhumane treatment. The owner confiscated her passport, so that she was prevented from leaving. When the police received a report about the case, they immediately seized the woman's travel document from the hotel and repatriated her to Ukraine. It is not clear whether the woman was given a recovery and reflection period, as well as appropriate care and services during such a period, whether the return was voluntary, or whether the authorities conducted any risk assessment to be satisfied that the return would be safe for her. These concerns still stand in light of the Trafficking Law, which merely recognizes the foreign victims' right to return to their countries safely and does not spell out procedural safeguards for the victims, such as the Government's obligations to provide for a recovery

and reflection period, and alternatives to repatriation to their countries of origin, and to carry out risk assessments to ensure that their repatriation would not jeopardize their safety and security. Consequently, the Trafficking Law does not conform fully to the standards entrenched in the Palermo Protocol.

# F. Prosecution and punishment

- 42. The Special Rapporteur found it difficult to obtain accurate information about the number and details of prosecution of trafficking cases, which seems to reflect confusion on the part of the authorities to properly identify cases of trafficking in persons. The Special Rapporteur regrets that it was not possible to accurately assess the progress that the Government has achieved so far in prosecuting trafficking cases, due to the lack of comprehensive and consistent statistics.
- According to the Court of Appeal and the Ministry of Interior, there have been four cases of trafficking which have been investigated and prosecuted as of April 2010. All of these cases reportedly involved foreign nationals who attempted to adopt Egyptian children, which is prohibited by law. However, it was not clear whether these cases of illegal adoption concerned trafficking in children. On the other hand, according to the National Coordinating Committee, two of the four prosecuted cases involved sexual exploitation of children. Indeed, consistent with the latter's reporting, the Special Rapporteur received information that in March 2009, the Alexandria Public Prosecutor's Office prosecuted two men suspected of kidnapping eight street children and forcing them into prostitution with wealthy Egyptians and tourists from the Gulf region. The men were reportedly convicted in May 2009 under the anti-trafficking provisions of the Penal Code. The court sentenced one of them to life imprisonment and the other to fifteen years' imprisonment. Further, in February 2010, the public prosecutor prosecuted in Cairo Criminal Court five persons suspected of facilitating the sexual exploitation of a 14-year-old girl from Tamoh village in the 6th of October Governorate, in the form of marriage to an older man from Saudi Arabia. The five persons included the Saudi husband of the girl, her parents, the marriage broker and the lawyer who respectively received payments from the Saudi husband.
- 44. In light of the above cases, it appears that no cases of trafficking in persons other than child trafficking have been investigated or prosecuted by the authorities. In particular, the Special Rapporteur did not receive any information about prosecution of perpetrators who have trafficked persons for the purposes of labour exploitation or removal of organs, despite the information suggesting the existence of these forms of trafficking and the legislative framework which allows prosecution of such cases. With the enactment of the Trafficking Law which prohibits all forms of trafficking in persons, the Special Rapporteur hopes that the authorities will intensify efforts to investigate and prosecute traffickers, regardless of whether they are public officials, or private persons or entities.

## G. Prevention

45. The Special Rapporteur noted that the Government has been implementing a range of awareness-raising activities, particularly targeting the media and the business community. In this regard, the leadership of First Lady Suzanne Mubarak has been instrumental in mobilizing the private sector and raising awareness of their role in the fight against trafficking. On 20 April 2010, the Special Rapporteur participated in a high-level meeting organized under Mrs. Mubarak's leadership, which brought together various stakeholders, including the business community and the media, to define roles and responsibilities of each actor in the national efforts to combat trafficking. The Suzanne Mubarak Women's International Peace Movement, an NGO founded by Mrs. Mubarak, has

been also actively conducting publicity campaigns on human trafficking, such as television spots on CNN International and vignette on in-flight screens of Emirates Airlines and Egypt Air.

- 46. While these awareness-raising activities are useful in attracting public attention, individuals at higher risk of being trafficked should be specifically targeted and provided with accurate information about the trend and manifestations of trafficking in persons. This is of vital importance, particularly in the context of Egypt, as there is still significant confusion about what trafficking in persons means. In this regard, the Special Rapporteur noted that the MFP launched campaigns in August 2009 to raise awareness about child marriage and "seasonal" or "temporary" marriage in governorates where the phenomenon is known to be prevalent, such as the 6th of October, Minya and Fayoum. As part of these campaigns, the MFP provided awareness-raising training to female rural leaders and volunteers in villages of Abu Alnomros, Badrasheen, Hawamdia, Fayoum and Minya. They, in turn, raised awareness among mothers and girls through meetings and home visits. Between August 2009 and February 2010, the MFP also provided training to 35 marriage clerks in the villages of the 6th of October Governorate on amendments to the Civil Status Law, and penalties for breaching the prohibition against child marriages.
- 47. Further, despite the awareness-raising training provided to the media, accurate reporting of the phenomenon of trafficking in persons still remains a challenge. The Special Rapporteur echoes the Government's concern that media tend to exaggerate stories of human trafficking, and conflate them with other related phenomena, such as irregular migration.
- 48. In addition, the potential of tourism authorities to contribute to raising awareness about trafficking does not seem to be fully exploited, as the Special Rapporteur did not observe any awareness-raising activities on safe tourism or child sex tourism initiated by the tourism authorities. In this regard, she was disappointed that she was unable to meet representatives of the Ministry of Tourism, Tourism Police, or any tourism companies registered with the Ministry of Tourism in Sharm el-Sheikh, to obtain first-hand information about their role and experience in preventing trafficking in persons.
- 49. The Special Rapporteur also found that while there is much emphasis on awareness-raising as a prevention tool, other aspects of prevention, such as addressing root causes of trafficking, seem to be neglected. While the Special Rapporteur commends El Salam Center's work of providing a daycare centre to children at risk, thus reducing their vulnerability to trafficking, she was not informed of other initiatives specifically designed to address root causes of trafficking, such as poverty, lack of employment opportunities, gender discrimination and inequality. This aspect of prevention appears to be an area which warrants the Government's action, particularly with regard to the above findings<sup>3</sup> by the MFP that the causes of child marriage are economic in most cases, such as poverty and the lack of employment opportunities.
- 50. The Special Rapporteur also notes that violence against women, particularly physical and sexual violence committed by their spouses, is reportedly widespread in Egypt. While the Penal Code in theory allows for the prosecution of domestic violence, perpetrators are often not punished in practice. Judges and prosecutors reportedly exercise discretion to dismiss case or reduce penalties, given the private nature of the violence and the general principle that "family is above the law", as established by the Court of Cassation. In accordance with this principle, the Court of Cassation dismissed a case of marital rape. Given the correlation between gender-based violence and trafficking, the

<sup>3</sup> See part II, section A.1 above.

Government should provide for an adequate legislative and institutional framework to address gender-based violence, gender discrimination and inequalities, as part of the strategies to prevent trafficking.

51. Curbing demand for exploitative labour and service is another aspect of prevention which has not received much attention by the Government. In this connection, the Special Rapporteur stresses that the protection of labour rights is essential in reducing demand for exploitative labour and preventing exploitation to take place in the first place. In light of the above information suggesting that there is a significant number of domestic workers who are victims of trafficking, there is a critical need to raise awareness of employers and potential employers about the labour rights of domestic workers under international human rights law and standards.

# H. Partnership

#### 1. Cooperation with civil society

- 52. Cooperation with the civil society is crucial, as the gap in the provision of assistance to trafficked persons to ensure their recovery, redress and reintegration is often filled by civil society organizations with relevant expertise and experience. In this regard, the Special Rapporteur was encouraged by steps taken to build effective partnerships between the Government and the civil society. For example, El Salam Center is operated in cooperation with an Egyptian NGO, which is responsible for the day-to-day management of the Center. Further, the Government strived to ensure effective participation of civil society, as shown by the meeting in September 2009 with more than 40 NGOs to brief them about the draft of the Trafficking Law, and the high-level meeting of 20 April, in which a number of civil society organizations participated.
- 53. The Special Rapporteur was concerned, however, that the degree of participation by civil society organizations in the formulation of anti-trafficking policies and programmes was still limited. The Special Rapporteur also received information that the drafting process of the Trafficking Law lacked transparency and that civil society organizations were not fully consulted. The Special Rapporteur was also concerned about the impact of the bill whereby General Federation for Civil Society Organization is responsible for monitoring and authorizing work of NGOs and the Ministry of Social Solidarity is given the power to pool and allocate donor funding to NGOs in their discretion. It is concerned that if this bill is enacted, it may unduly restrict the sphere of operation of NGOs.

#### 2. International, regional and bilateral cooperation

- 54. At the international level, Egypt has been actively participating in international forums and contributing to discussions and debates on the global fight against trafficking in persons. Most notably, as a member of the Group of Friends United against Human Trafficking of the United Nations, Egypt played an active role in promoting the thematic dialogue on human trafficking at the General Assembly in May 2009, and in negotiating the eventual adoption of the Global Action Plan against Human Trafficking.
- 55. Furthermore, Egypt has been a prominent player in regional cooperation in combating trafficking in persons. In the African region, at the eleventh African Union Summit held in June 2008, Egypt proposed a decision calling for strengthening cooperation between the United Nations and the African Union in combating trafficking in persons, which was adopted by consensus. Further, the Government of Egypt is a member of the League of Arab States, which adopted in 2005 the "Arab guiding law on fighting human trafficking", and which plans to develop a regional plan of action on combating trafficking in persons in the future. In addition, in December 2008, Egypt organized a meeting of Arab

experts on direct assistance to victims of trafficking in cooperation with IOM, and participated in the launch of the "Arab initiative for building national capacities for combating human trafficking" in Doha, in March 2010.

It appears that bilateral cooperation with sending and receiving states is an area which could be further developed and explored, with particular attention to protecting the labour rights of migrants. The Special Rapporteur notes that Egypt has bilateral agreements with some sending and receiving states. For instance, Egypt has a bilateral labour migration agreement with Italy, which governs the entry, residence and recruitment of Egyptian workers. Alongside this agreement, Egypt and Italy have the Integrated Migration Information System, which provides information on job opportunities and migrants' rights and duties in Italy, as well as the Information Dissemination on Migration project, which disseminates information about risks of irregular migration. In terms of cooperation with sending states, the notable example is the Four Freedom Agreement signed with the Government of Sudan in 2004, which allows citizens of Egypt and Sudan to freely move across the border and provides for the rights to reside, work and own property without a permit. These agreements, albeit a positive step, have not had substantial impact in the fight against trafficking, which points to the need to further strengthen bilateral cooperation, particularly in protecting migrants' rights and preventing an exploitative form of migration which may lead to trafficking.

# III. Positive post-mission developments

- The Government has made significant progress in addressing trafficking in persons since the Special Rapporteur's country visit in April 2010. First, the National Centre for Social and Criminological Research (NCSCR) completed its national study on trafficking in persons in September 2010. While the Special Rapporteur has not had the opportunity to examine the full report in English, she welcomes the findings of the study, which shed light on the trend and manifestations of trafficking in persons in Egypt. For instance, the study revealed that a large number of Egyptian women are trafficked for the purpose of sexual exploitation within the country. NCSCR conducted a survey of 294 Egyptian women who were convicted of prostitution, and found that a half of the women were victims of trafficking for the purpose of commercial sexual exploitation. Most of them were young, divorced women between 15 and 30 years old, and were recruited with false promises of job opportunities. The study also indicated that trafficking in human organs is one of the most prevalent forms of human trafficking in Egypt. According to the study, well-known doctors and hospitals are often implicated in the procedures to remove organs and the price of organs range from 5,000 to 120,000 Egyptian pounds. While welcoming the outcomes of the study, the Special Rapporteur did not receive information on how the NCSCR selected interviewees and what questions they asked to conduct the study. The Special Rapporteur hopes that the Government will further enhance cooperation with the United Nations country team to carry out any follow-up study to collect accurate and comprehensive data and statistics on the trend of trafficking in persons in Egypt.
- 58. Second, the MFP and IOM jointly established a shelter for female victims of trafficking in the El Salam area of Cairo in August 2010, marking a significant step forward in respecting the right of trafficked persons to recovery. The shelter is open to both Egyptian and non-Egyptian victims of trafficking and managed by personnel who are trained in psychosocial assistance and shelter management by IOM. The Special Rapporteur hopes that additional shelters for trafficked men and boys will also be established in the future in order to ensure holistic assistance to all groups of trafficked persons.

59. Lastly, the first National Plan of Action against Human Trafficking (NPA) was launched in December 2010. The NPA covers a two-year period from January 2011 to January 2013 and is based on four objectives of prevention, protection of society and trafficked persons, prosecution of traffickers, and participation of various stakeholders. The Special Rapporteur positively notes that the National Plan of Action envisages, inter alia, (a) the establishment of identification procedures and a national referral mechanism in 2012; (b) the establishment of legal clinics at law schools in cooperation with the Protection Project of John Hopkins University to provide legal assistance to trafficked persons; and (c) the implementation of income-generating programmes, over a period of five years, in cooperation with the social fund for development.

# IV. Conclusions and recommendations

#### A. Conclusions

- 60. The Special Rapporteur commends the progress that the Government of Egypt has made in addressing the phenomenon of trafficking in persons, as reflected by the establishment of the National Coordinating Committee and the important legislative developments in recent years. Most notably, the National Coordinating Committee has taken the lead in the enactment of the Trafficking Law, which is a significant and fundamental step forward in the efforts to combat trafficking in persons. With respect to children, the Ministry of Family and Population (MFP) is a strong advocate for child rights, and plays a key role in raising awareness about "temporary" or "seasonal" marriage of girls. Further, the Government of Egypt has intensified cooperation with international organizations, particularly in the area of capacity building of law enforcement officials. At the international and regional levels, the Government has increased its visibility as a State committed to fight trafficking in persons through its active participation in discussions and debates on trafficking in persons.
- 61. However, fundamental challenges still remain to be addressed if trafficking in persons is to be effectively tackled and the human rights of trafficked persons are to be respected and protected. In the Special Rapporteur's view, challenges in the following areas warrant urgent attention and action by the Government of Egypt: collection of accurate and comprehensive data on trafficking in persons, and thorough analysis of the trend and forms of trafficking; establishment of proper identification and referral mechanisms for trafficked persons; building adequate and appropriate infrastructure and services to meet the needs of trafficked persons; implementation of measures directed at addressing root causes of trafficking; protection of migrants' labour rights, particularly labour rights of domestic migrant workers.

### **B.** Recommendations

- 62. Based on these conclusions, the Special Rapporteur recommends that the Government of Egypt:
- 63. Continue its efforts to collect accurate and comprehensive data on the forms and manifestations of trafficking in persons in the country, using an effective and appropriate methodology to accurately capture the complex phenomenon of trafficking in persons. To this end, the Special Rapporteur urges the Government of Egypt to further enhance cooperation with the United Nations country team and to

engage in open and close consultation with them, particularly the IOM which has relevant expertise and experience.

- 64. Ensure the effective implementation of the National Plan of Action (NPA) and further reinforce it by clearly setting out methods of monitoring and evaluation. The Government should regularly monitor and evaluate the NPA with the participation of all stakeholders and in consonance with international human rights standards that promote respect for the rights of trafficked persons.
- 65. Allocate adequate resources to the National Coordinating Committee and strengthen its capacity to effectively coordinate all anti-trafficking efforts and provide coherent strategic guidance in the fight against trafficking. The Government of Egypt should consider establishing a national rapporteur's office or a separate government agency specifically dedicated to developing, implementing and coordinating policies and programmes to combat trafficking in persons.
- 66. Adopt and amend relevant legislation that would contribute to preventing human trafficking. The Special Rapporteur specifically recommends that:
  - The Labour Code be extended to protect domestic workers, who are often at higher risk of abuse and exploitation;
  - Both the Labour Code and the Child Law be amended to prohibit exploitative forms of domestic work performed by children;
  - The Penal Code specifically criminalize violence in the private sphere, given the correlation between trafficking and gender-based violence, such as domestic violence.
- 67. Provide comprehensive training programmes to increase knowledge and awareness of human trafficking among all stakeholders, particularly the police, immigration and border guards, and labour inspectors, with a view to equipping them with skills to accurately identify cases of trafficking.
- 68. Enhance efforts to eliminate "seasonal" or "temporary" marriages which amount to trafficking of women and girls for the purpose of exploitation. The Government of Egypt should continue to carry out targeted campaigns to raise awareness of potential victims and communities about the risks, and to equip law enforcement authorities with knowledge and skills to properly prosecute and punish individuals who commit or are implicated in the crime, pursuant to the Trafficking Law.
- 69. Establish procedures to identify trafficked persons and a referral mechanism to ensure that they are referred to the appropriate service providers for assistance. The Government of Egypt should create guidelines for identification and referral of trafficked persons for distribution to all officials who may come into contact with trafficked persons, including the police, immigration officials, border guards, labour inspectors, and medical and health professionals.
- 70. Create a separate 24-hour hotline dedicated to victims of trafficking and staffed by personnel adequately trained to identify trafficked persons and to provide the necessary assistance to them. The Government of Egypt should also ensure that the personnel can speak languages other than Arabic, and in particular English and languages spoken by groups known to be trafficked to Egypt, such as Indonesians and Russians.
- 71. Continue and strengthen its efforts to train journalists on effective reporting of trafficking in persons, so as to convey accurate information about the manifestations of trafficking and not stigmatize trafficked persons.

- 72. Intensify its efforts to train prosecutors and judges on trafficking in persons and the provisions of the Trafficking Law, so that they can effectively investigate, prosecute and punish traffickers.
- 73. Establish, as a matter of urgency, shelter facilities for all trafficked persons where they may seek refuge from further harm and exploitation, regardless of their age, sex, nationality or immigration status. Service providers should be adequately trained to respond effectively to the needs of trafficked persons.
- 74. Enhance its current efforts to establish facilities to provide physical and psychological care and services for trafficked persons, along with any other system necessary to realizing such services, such as a referral mechanism. In this regard, the Special Rapporteur specifically recommends that a referral mechanism or an interim referral mechanism be established as soon as possible, so that the existing facilities, such as the Trafficking Victims Support Unit at the National Bank Hospital, may be fully utilized.
- 75. Create a system to provide legal assistance to trafficked persons in accordance with the Trafficking Law, and provide training to lawyers and paralegals on the issue of trafficking in persons.
- 76. In the case of foreign victims of trafficking, ensure that immigration officials do not repatriate foreign victims of trafficking, unless the repatriation is voluntary and the authorities have conducted a risk assessment to ensure that their safety upon return would not be jeopardized. Foreign victims of trafficking should also be given a reflection and recovery period, and a special permit to remain in the country temporarily or permanently in appropriate cases, as well as necessary assistance for their recovery, such as adequate shelters, medical and psychological counselling, legal and other assistance.
- 77. Intensify awareness-raising campaigns, targeting groups at higher risk of being trafficked, as well as individuals or entities in the position to break the trafficking chain, such as tourism companies.
- 78. Develop comprehensive prevention programmes to raise awareness on human trafficking and discourage sex tourism in cooperation with the tourism sector under the leadership of the Ministry of Tourism. Furthermore, the Government of Egypt should train staff in this sector to identify trafficked persons and make necessary referrals.
- 79. Address the root causes of trafficking, such as poverty, unemployment, education, gender discrimination and inequalities, including gender-based violence. The Government of Egypt should implement initiatives and programmes which effectively alleviate these factors which contribute to vulnerability to trafficking, particularly targeting the population at higher risk of being trafficked.
- 80. Respect, protect and fulfil the human rights of migrants, in accordance with the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families (ICRMW), to which Egypt is party, as a tool for preventing trafficking. In this regard, the Government of Egypt is encouraged to enhance the existing bilateral labour migration agreements with receiving or sending states to protect the labour rights of migrant workers, and/or to seek to adopt such agreements with other receiving or sending states.
- 81. Strengthen partnerships with civil society organizations, particularly in view of its experience and expertise in working on related issues, such as violence against women and children. The Government of Egypt should enhance its current efforts to

encourage participation of civil society organizations in formulating anti-trafficking policies and programmes and to fully take their views into account.